

Imperial College London

NERA Economic Consulting

Minutes of meeting to:MoM. No.:16011094/5Distribution Code Review Panel (DCRP) P2 WG P2From:DNV GLReview Monthly Meeting 5Date:27/5/2015Copied to:Prep. By:Colin MacKenzie

David Spilliet DCRP P2 WG NERA attendees Imperial College attendees DNV GL attendees

DCRP P2 WG P2 Review Project

Time/Place: 10:30 – 13:3pm, Electricity Network Association, 6th Floor, Dean Bradley

House, 52 Horseferry Road, London SW1P 2AF, meeting room 4. Also via

conference call facility.

Participants: Mike Kay (Electricity North West) MK

David Spillett (Energy Networks Association) DS Steve Cox (Electricity North West) SC Alan Boardman (UK Power Networks) ABo Suzanne Huntley (Northern Ireland Electricity) SH Andy Beddoes (Scottish Power Energy Networks) ABe Saeed Ahmed (GTC-UK) SA Ben Marshall (National Grid) BM Will Monnaie (Scotish Southern Energy Power Distribution) JS Bob Weaver (Power Con) BW Joe Duddy (RES) JD Colin MacKenzie (DNV GL) CMacK Ljubomir Mitrasevic (DNV GL) LM Goran Strbac (Imperial College London) (From 12:00) GS Predrag Djapic (Imperial College London) PD Richard Druce (NERA) (from 11:45) RD Konrad Borkowski (NERA) KΒ Tony Berndes (Western Power Distribution) ТВ Chris Marsland (AMPS) CM Gareth Evans (Ofgem) GE

P2 Review Working Group Monthly Meeting 5

1. Meeting objectives

Appologies:

The main objectives of the meeting were to:

Review progress on actions from the last meeting,

Mark Kilcullen (DECC)

Alan Birch (DNV GL)

Alan Creighton (Northern Powergrid)

Provide a brief update on progress to date and any issues,

DNV GL Headquarters, Veritasveien 1, P.O.Box 300, 1322 Høvik, Norway. Tel: +47 67 57 99 00. www.dnvgl.com

MKK

AC

ABi

Page 2 of 10

- Gather WG feedback on proposals for the WS2.7 report (review of NERA MEMO on this subject circulated prior to the meeting).
- Discuss possibility of changing July 29 WG meeting to allow Goran Strbac to present results from Imperial analysis.

<u>Agenda</u>

1	Introductions welcome to ENA and housekeeping (Fire Procedure etc.)	sc	10:30
2	Statement on aim of meeting and key agenda items	C MacK	10:40
3	Review of actions from last meeting.	C MacK	10:45
4	Brief update on progress to date and tasks programmed over next month.	C MacK	11:30
5	NERA led discussion of memo setting out in more detail the scope of the report covering Work Stream 2.7 (MEMO attached)	RD	11:45
	Break		12:45
6	July 29 th meeting. Discuss rescheduling to let Goran present initial WS2 results.	C MacK	13:00
7	AOB	sc	13:05
8	Summary review of new actions	C MacK	13:15
9	Next Meeting – 22 June 2015		13:30

3. Review progress on actions from the last meeting.

CMacK went through the summary list of actions outstanding from the previous meetings, see list in Appendix A. Any amendments or updates to the outstanding actions are noted below in the red text.

Summary of Amended Actions

Action/Responsible/Due Date

	What has changed over the last 18 months	
3	Smart Grid Forum WS 7 project, DCRP P2 WG to provide Consortium with update on project outputs that could have an impact on the P2 review.	The available WS7 report was provided by ENA on 2 March 2015. Action complete .
	Based on meeting on 26 Feb 2015 MK is to provide the presently available report setting out the WS7	The first WS7 report to be provided by DCRP P2 WG by 30 March 2015 subject to report release

Page 3 of 10

		Action/Responsible/Due Date
	project, followed by a soon to be published report first WS7 report setting out the scope.	date. Ongoing MK to check the Consortium has this. (Post meeting note, MK forwarded reports during the meeting, action complete).
	Consortium to consider impact of WS7 information provided by DCRP P2 WG on P2 review. WS 2 activity for NERA and Imperial.	
		GS, RD /Consortium PM/during workstream 2.
		Ongoing
11	DCRP P2 WG is to advise any other party that they would wish to peer review the modelling inputs	DCRP P2 WG/DS/ by 23 Feb 2015.
	and out puts in anticipation of a public consultation	Outstanding (agreed on 27/3/2015 to leave
	on proposals that may be justified (in part) by	this open for further discussion with Ofgem
	evidence produced using Imperial's techno-	would raised this item) SC to discuss this
	economic model.	with Gareth Evens of Ofgem.
2.3	DS to provide the consortium with the names and	DS/ DS/ 23 March 2015
	contact details of the key individuals at each DNO	
	who should be interviewed directly as part of work	Ongoing in collaboration with Consortium
	stream 2 (i.e. individuals responsible for setting	(awaiting WPD names). The Consortium to
	policy for the DNO's network planning teams to	assume Tony Berndes is the only contact
	follow).	for time being.

4. Brief update on progress to date and tasks programmed over next month.

CMacK presented a summary of progress to the 24 May, see table below. Noted that the formal progress report is awaiting update information from Imperial and will be completed and release when this information is received, target date Friday 29 May.

Work stream/sub-work stream	Deliverable	Activity Status
Work Stream 1-Project Initiation	Issue of initiation paper	Completed.
Work Stream 2 - Assessment of P2/6 and Identifying Options for Reform		Ongoing
WS2.0 Stakeholder interviews (intimate)	A summary report covering key highlights from the stakeholder engagement/interview activities.	Ongoing Urgently require agreement on missing interview dates with some DNOs
WS2.1 Framework for assessing security performance and measures and characteristic network designs	Framework for the development of future network design standards	Ongoing Urgently require RRP data pack.
WS2.2 Service quality and cost effectiveness of the delivered to consumers by the present network	Summary report that will feed into the 'options' milestone report	Ongoing Urgently require RRP data pack.

Page 4 of 10

design practises		
WS2.3 Risk associated with asset replacement, common mode failures and high impact events	Summary report that will feed into the 'options' milestone report	Ongoing Urgently require RRP data pack.
WS2.4 Impact of Smart Grid technologies on service quality risk profile	Summary report that will feed into the 'options' milestone report	Ongoing Urgently require RRP data pack.
WS2.5 Assessment of impacts of alternative control and operation strategies on security of supply	Summary report that will feed into the 'options' milestone report	Ongoing Urgently require RRP data pack.
WS2.6. Loss inclusive design of distribution networks and impact on security of supply	Summary report that will feed into the 'options' milestone report	Started Urgently require RRP data pack.
WS2.7: Alignment of security of supply standard in distribution networks with other codes and schemes	Summary report that will feed into the 'options' milestone report	Initial start made. Requires feedback on MEMO presented by R Druce.
WS2.9: Options for future development of distribution network standard including 1st Iteration of the Techno economic Model	Summary report that will feed into the 'options' milestone report	Consortium starting to think about how we link everything together.

Progress: Key points noted on progress were:

- 1. A number of the WS2 sub work-streams urgently require the Regulatory Reporting Pack data identified from ongoing DCRP P2 WG/Consortium collaboration and presently being collated and anonymised by Peter Twomey of ENWL.
- 2. Peter Twomey has completed the collation and anonymising of the RRP tables for the 14 license areas. However, for the next stage of data gathering he does not have access to the QoS works books for the other DNOs. Requests for the following information from the other DNOs have been made on 20 May, with a reminder on the 26 May.
 - a. QoS Interruptions Stage Data Reporting Workbook (Workbook 2) 2010/11 to 2013/14, and if available 2014/15
 - b. QoS HV disaggregation reporting workbook (Workbook 3) 2010/11, 2011/12, 2012/13, and 2013/14.
- 3. The DCRP P2 WG representatives for SSE, SP, UKPN, NPG and WPD are asked to provide this information to Peter Twomey. The target date for Peter to get all the RRP data to the Consortium is Friday 29 May 2015 and SSE, SP, UKPN, NPG, WPD are asked to get this information in time for him to meet this target. SC reiterated the need to complete this action to avoid the programme slipping. DS will speak with AC of NPG as he was not on the call.
- 4. Again to avoid the programme slipping there is a need for urgency in the DNOs, completing and returning the Consortium questionnaire and setting up interview dates to review the responses to the questionnaire. The draft list of interview dates already agreed is provided in the table below.

Page 5 of 10

Participants	Contact Name	Date
UKPN	Alan Boardman	
SSEPD	Will Monnaie	9th June
SPEN	Diyar Kadar /Andy Beddoes	
WPD	Tony Berndes	Thur 28th May
ENWL	Mike Kay	Thur 28th May
NPG	Alan Creighton	
NIE	Suzanne Huntley	N/A
Ofgem	Gareth Evans	Mon 1st June
DECC	Mark Kilcullen	Thurs 21 May
GTC	Saeed Ahmed	
RenewablesUK	Zoltan Zavody	
Nat Grid	Ben Marshall	Tue 9th June

- 5. ENWL has completed and returned the questionnaire and an interview with MK will be carried out on 28 May (now completed). Abe, AC, WM, Abo and BM are asked to ensure their respective company questionnaire responses are completed and returned to the Consortium prior to the interviews and that interview dates are agreed ASAP. (Post meeting note: WPD had not managed to complete their questionnaire prior to the interview on 28 May, hence, at the interview it was agreed to allow WPD time to complete and reschedule the interview.
- 6. Andy Beddoes of SP requested that the questionnaire is resent to him. CMacK to action this.
- 7. Regarding the appearance of GTC and RenewableUK on the list of companies to interview, CMacK clarified that this was a mistake (post meeting note, this was a "cut and paste error" when constructing the email concerned). Interviews were only planned for the DNOs, NG, DECC and Ofgem to go through their questionnaire responses as these stakeholders have a key interest in the everyday application of the P2 standard. All other identified stakeholders had been sent the questionnaire and were encouraged to respond to as many of the questions as they wished. If any of these stakeholders wish to speak with the consortium regarding the questionnaire, the Consortium will be happy to do so. It was agreed that CMacK would issue a clarification note to all DCRP P2 WG members along with the list of all stakeholders sent the questionnaire and who would be invited to participate in further stakeholder engagement. The reason for circulating the stakeholder list is to allow DCRP P2 WG members to add in any missing stakeholders and contact details for their representatives.
- 8. Noted that Zoltan Zavody is moving on from RenewablesUK. CMacK is to establish a replacement representative at RUK to add to our stakeholder list for engagement.

Page 6 of 10

5. WG feedback on proposals for the WS2.7 report

RD produced a MEMO dated 18 May "For Discussion: Proposed Outline of the Work-stream 2.7 Report on the Regulatory Issues Associated with Reform or Replacement of P2/6" which was circulated to the WG on 20 May 2015 for review. RD led a page by page discussion of the WS2.7 report proposals in the MEMO and gather feedback. RD requested that DCRP P2 WG members should provide their written feedback by Friday 5th June 2015.

Key points noted during the discussion, for RD and the Consortium to note are as follows:

- The lead in to the report should include a much better description of what the present P2/6 Engineering Recommendation actually is.
- Section 2, there is a fifth high level option which would be a hybrid standard combining elements
 of a deterministic standard similar to the present P2/6 standard with CBA based elements. This
 may require some level of deterministic based spine. RD requested that those that had a view
 on this hybrid solution should provide further explanation on what deterministic and CBA
 elements should be built in.
- Section 4, transparency may be an issue with a CBA base standard due to the complexity of actions required. Also, all customers are not homogeneous in their security requirements and a spread of values may need to be considered.
- Section 4.1, noted point that VOLL is not the same as the Ofgem ILL value. Ofgem has consulted on VOLL; however this did not consider generation. VOLL may change considerably with time e.g. moving from 2015 to 2025. Should generation VOLL be considered. Confidence in VOLL values should be considered.
- Section 5.0 RD asked for feedback on the scope of questions.
- Section 5.2, RD would welcome comments on interaction with the NETS SQSS with the present P2 and thoughts on a future P2. BM indicated that any new standard must allow correct investment decisions across distribution/transmission boundaries. Also DG has a large impact on some distribution/transmission boundaries that need to be accounted for.
- Page 6 last bullet point, SC indicated that the Consortium needed to be careful not to exceed the terms of reference of the review e.g. any future P2 standard would not be introducing a standard for the treatment of losses.

6. July 29th meeting. Discuss rescheduling to let Goran present initial WS2 results.

A request had been made by Goran Strbac to move the July monthly DCRP P2 WG to either the week after that of 29 July or the week before. Agreed that this may be difficult, however, DS will circulate a note to the group to see if this request could be accommodated.

SC pointed out that the DCRP P2 WG monthly meeting on 25 November clashed with another DCRP meeting for him and asked if DS could look at moving this to a date either side of 25 November.

7. AOB

Request for AOB made by SC, no other business indicated and the meeting was closed.

Page 7 of 10

8. Summary of new actions.

		Action/Responsible/Due Date
	Progress	
5.1	DNOs to get the missing RRP data for QoS to Peter Twomey of ENWL ASAP to allow him to send the full anonymised RRP data pack to the consortium by 29 may.	Abo,AC,Abe,TB,WM/DS/29 May 2015.
5.2	DS to speak with AC of NPG regarding the need to get the missing RRP data for QoS to Peter Twomey of ENWL ASAP, as AC was not on the call	DS/DS/28 June 2015
5.3	DNOs to complete the P2 questionnaire and return to ABi prior their interviews. All DNOs to arrange interview dates with ABi ASAP.	Abo,AC,Abe,TB,WM/DS/29 May 2015.
5.4	Questionnaire to be sent out again to Andy Beddoes.	CMacK/CMacK/29 May 2015. (Action complete)
5.5	CMacK to issue a clarification note via DS to all DCRP P2 WG members regarding stakeholders that will be interviewed, having completed a questionnaire and those that will be invited to complete questionnaires only. CMacK is also to issue the list of stakeholders for review by the DCRP P2 WG members in order that they can advise any missing key industry stakeholders.	CMacK/CMacK/29 May 2015.
5.6	CMacK to find out who the replacement contact at RenewableUK will be for Zoltan Zavody.	CMacK/CMacK/5 June 2015.
5.7	The DCRP P2 WG members are to provide there written feedback on RD's MEMO on the WS2.7 report.	AII/DS/5 June 2015
5.8	DS to establish if the July 29 meeting can be moved to accommodate Goran Strbac's request.	DS/DS/12 June 2015
5.9	DS to establish if the November 25 meeting can be moved to accommodate Steve Cox's request.	DS/DS/12 June 2015
5.10	DS to ensure John Scott comments to the 1 May stakeholder event mailbox are circulated to all DCRP P2 WG members.	DS/DS/12 June 2015

Next Meetings

The programmed next meetings for the DCRP P2 WG are:

DCRP P2 WG Meeting No.	Date
6	Monday 22 June
7	Wednesday 29 July
8	Wednesday 19 Aug

Page 8 of 10

9	Wednesday 23 Sept
10	Wednesday 28 Oct Provisionally moved to Tuesday 27 Oct, DS to confirm.
11	Wednesday 25 Nov
12	Friday 18 December

- All meetings will commence at 10:30 at the ENA unless advised otherwise.
 Any material for circulation prior to the meeting should allow sufficient time for WG members to read prior to the meeting and as a minimum should allow 2 working days.



Imperial College London

NERA Economic Consulting

Recap on the key P2 study issues

on meeting on 26 Feb 2015 MK is to provide the

project, followed by a soon to be published report

presently available report setting out the WS7

11 DCRP P2 WG is to advise any other party that they

would wish to peer review the modelling inputs and out puts in anticipation of a public consultation on

proposals that may be justified (in part) by evidence

produced using Imperial's techno-economic model.

first WS7 report setting out the scope.

Appendix A Summary of Outstanding Actions at 1 May 2015

What has changed over the last 18 months Consortium to consider the impact of relevant LCNF GS, RD/Consortium PM/during workstream 2. projects now they are more mature, special examples could include Electricity North West 's C2C Ongoing project and DSR related projects in general on the P2 review. WS 2 activity for NERA and Imperial. RIIO price control period commences with a new GS, RD /Consortium PM/during workstream 2. interruption incentive scheme, etc. Consortium to consider impacts during WS 2 techno-economic Ongoing modelling. WS 2 activity for NERA and Imperial Smart Grid Forum WS 7 project, DCRP P2 WG to The available WS7 report was provided by ENA provide Consortium with update on project outputs on 2 March 2015. Action complete. that could have an impact on the P2 review. Based

date. Ongoing

The first WS7 report to be provided by DCRP P2

WG by 30 March 2015 subject to report release

Action/Responsible/Due Date

	Consortium to consider impact of WS7 information	GS, RD /Consortium PM/during workstream 2.
	provided by DCRP P2 WG on P2 review. WS 2	
	activity for NERA and Imperial.	Ongoing
4	Losses has been raised as a key issue by Ofgem	GS, RD /Consortium PM/during workstream 2.
	driven by EU directives. Consortium to review and	
	include in techno-economic assessments. WS 2	Ongoing
	activity for NERA and Imperial.	
5	Any issues relating to supply security in the latest	GS, RD /Consortium PM/during workstream 2.
	ENTSO-E 10 year plan should be considered for	
	potential impact on the P2 review. WS 2 activity for	Ongoing
	NERA and Imperial.	

DNV GL Headquarters, Veritasveien 1, P.O.Box 300, 1322 Høvik, Norway. Tel: +47 67 57 99 00. www.dnvgl.com

DCRP P2 WG/DS/ by 23 Feb 2015.

would raised this item)

Outstanding (agreed on 27/3/2015 to leave

this open for further discussion with Ofgem

Page 10 of 10

Action/Responsible/Due Date

		•
	Overall governance	
12	Consortium to ensure all corespondance with DCRP P2 WG comes from the Consortium PM to David Spillet as the single points of contact in each organisation.	All consortium members/Consortium PM/ongoing.
2.1	Regarding actions not carried out by the DCRP P2 WG, CM is to chase DS to resolve these issues. Stakeholder Engagement	CM/CM/ Ongoing
	otakonolasi zngagoment	
2.3	DS to provide the consortium with the names and contact details of the key individuals at each DNO who should be interviewed directly as part of work stream 2 (i.e. individuals responsible for setting policy for the DNO's network planning teams to follow).	DS/ DS/ 23 March 2015 Ongoing in collaboration with Consortium (awaiting WPD names)
		Action/Responsible/Due Date
	DNO data request for WS2 quantitative analysis	
4.1	GS to ensure Imperial complete the review of the NPG RRP and report back on suitability of data and identify the work books and sheets required.	GS/GS/6 May 2015. Complete (GS provided work books and data sheets required in his email of 5 May 2015. GS also confirmed at the conference call meeting on 12 May that the RRP provides all the data requirements, but would require a set of data over five years for each of the six GB DNOs)
4.2	MK to assess how data from RRP from all six DNOs could be anonymised.	MK/MK/12 May 2015 (Noted from conference call on 12 May that Peter Twomey of ENWL has been tasked with anonymising the RRP data from each of the DNOs and sending on to the consortium)
4.3	DS to ask Ofgem if they could provide the Consortium with their RRP data.	DS/DS/ 12 May 2015 (Post meeting note. Based on the discussions or the conference call of 12 May, this action may not be required, this will be assessed again at a later date)